



**SAN FRANCISCO PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION
RATE FAIRNESS BOARD
CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO**

**Minutes of Special Meeting
Tuesday, April 11, 2023, 10:00 AM – 12:00 PM
(Approved April 28, 2023)**

Members of the Rate Fairness Board will attend this meeting in-person. Members of the public are invited to observe the meeting in-person or remotely online as described below. Members of the public attending the meeting in person or remotely online will have an opportunity to provide public comment on every item. It is possible that not every person in the queue will have an opportunity to provide remote public comment.

In-person Meeting: San Francisco Public Utilities Commission (SFPUC), 525 Golden Gate Avenue, 3rd Floor, Tuolumne Conference Room, San Francisco, CA 94102

Virtually Via Zoom:

1. Modern Browser (WebRTC) [Best]

Please join with a modern browser such as Google Chrome or Microsoft Edge (no additional installation required)

2. Mobile Apple iOS or Android devices: Mobile users can also join with Zoom Cloud Meetings App on [Apple App Store](#) iOS or [Google Play Store](#) Android

3. Meeting [Link](#)

Meeting ID: 898 4902 4866

Passcode: 340499

4. Join by Telephone [Audio only]: US: +1 669 900 6833 or +1 213 338 8477 or +1 669 219 2599 or +1 646 518 9805

Meeting ID: 898 4902 4866

Passcode: 340499

Meeting will be recorded for minutes only and will not be published. By joining this meeting, you agree to be recorded during the duration of this meeting.

London N. Breed
Mayor

Newsha K. Ajami
President

Sophie Maxwell
Vice President

Tim Paulson
Commissioner

Anthony Rivera
Commissioner

Kate H. Stacy
Commissioner

Dennis J. Herrera
General Manager



MEETING AGENDA

Materials Distributed: Special Meeting Agenda for April 11, 2023; Draft Special Meeting Minutes of March 17, 2023; Copy of public comment received by email on March 28, 2023; Responses to Requests from Board Members on 2023 Water and Sewer Rates Study presentation; Fiscal Year 2023-2024 CleanPowerSF Rates presentation; Rate Fairness Board Recommendations to San Francisco Public Utilities Commission on 2023 Water and Sewer Rates Study draft presentation; Draft SFPUC Rate Fairness Board Bylaws

1. Call to Order

The special meeting of the SFPUC Rate Fairness Board (RFB) was called to order at 10:04 AM in-person and via teleconference.

2. Roll Call

Member Name/Title	Appointed By
Howard Ash, Chair, Residential City Retail Customer	Board of Supervisors
Trisha McMahon, Budget and Planning Manager	City Administrator
Ken Hinton, Budget and Revenue Analyst	Controller's Office
Vishal Trivedi, Financial Analyst of Office of Public Finance	Controller's Office
Vacant, City Retail Small Business Customer	Board of Supervisors
Vacant, City Retail Large Business Customer	Mayor's Office
Vacant, Residential City Retail Customer	Mayor's Office

Roll Call:

- Present: Chair Ash, Member Hinton, Member McMahon, Member Trivedi*

3. General Public Comment

Members of the public may address the Rate Fairness Board (RFB) on matters that are within the Board's jurisdiction but not on today's agenda.

Public Comment: The RFB Secretary read a public comment from Mr. Don Levison that was received by email on March 28, 2023.

4. Approval of the Special Meeting Minutes of March 17, 2023

(Discussion and Action)

Chair Ash asked Board for comments, questions, or concerns. There were no comments from the Board.

Public Comment: Mr. David Pilpel had one suggested edit to the March 17, 2023 meeting minutes.

The minutes of the special meeting of March 17, 2023, were adopted, as amended, unanimously upon a motion by Member Trivedi and seconded by Member McMahon.

Roll Call Vote:

- Ayes: Chair Ash, Member Hinton, Member McMahon, Member Trivedi

5. Report of the Chair

a. Responses to Requests from Board Members on 2023 Water and Sewer Rates Study

(Presentation and Discussion)

Matthew Freiberg, SFPUC Principal Revenue/Rates Analyst

Matthew Freiberg presented the Fiscal Year 2023-2024 CleanPowerSF Rates Setting. Presentation included the following topics: water/sewer customer bill impacts, rate structure impact on single-family residential bills, and annual general fund water and sewer bill. Discussion transpired throughout presentation. Member Hinton noted that City departments are facing simultaneous pressures on gas and steam costs alongside SFPUC rate increases.

Public Comment: Mr. David Pilpel wanted to know the bill impacts on Non-General Fund Departments. He also wanted to know the total revenue shift for water and wastewater.

Public Comment: Ms. Amy Nagengast wanted to better understand how the increased rates would impact the San Francisco Airport.

b. Fiscal Year 2023-2024 CleanPowerSF Rates

(Presentation and Discussion)

Yee Nwe (Ma Yee) Yap, SFPUC Principal Revenue/Rates Analyst

Yee Nwe (Ma Yee) Yap presented on the Fiscal Year 2023-2024 CleanPowerSF Rates. Presentation included the following topics: rates setting, revenue requirement, cost of service rates, rate design, proposed CleanPowerSF generation rates, bill impact, delegated authority, and upcoming milestones. Discussion transpired throughout presentation.

Member McMahon asked how many customers switched from PG&E residential E-ELEC rates to CleanPowerSF residential E-ELEC rates. Ma Yee Yap expressed that PG&E will respond to SFPUC with the results.

Public Comment: Mr. David Pilpel had various questions and comments on the Fiscal Year 2023-2024 CleanPowerSF rates and implementation.

6. Items Initiated by Board Members

a. Rate Fairness Board Recommendations to San Francisco Public Utilities Commission on 2023 Water and Sewer Rates Study

(Discussion and Possible Action)

Chair Ash went through the draft Rate Fairness Board presentation on the SFPUC staff proposed power rates and water/wastewater rates. The Board Members would like to see the consultant's water and sewer rates study report before making more comments/edits on the Rate Fairness Board recommendation to the San Francisco Public Utilities Commission. Discussion transpired throughout.

Public Comment: Mr. David Pilpel had comments on the refuse rates setting process and the system reliability.

b. Rate Fairness Board Bylaws

(Discussion and Action)

Chair Ash went through the changes on specific sections in the bylaws. The Board Members suggested some edits to the bylaws. Discussion transpired throughout.

Public Comment: Mr. David Pilpel had some suggestions and comments to the edits in the bylaws.

The Rate Fairness Board Bylaws or Rules of Order, were adopted, as amended, unanimously upon a motion by Member Trivedi and seconded by Member McMahon.

Roll Call Vote:

- Ayes: Chair Ash, Member Hinton, Member McMahon, Member Trivedi

Announcements and Requests for Future Agenda Items

(Discussion)

Chair Ash asked when the next meeting will be scheduled. The next meeting is tentatively scheduled for the week of April 24th.

Chair Ash expressed that he intends to present at the May 9th Commission meeting on the Fiscal Year 2023-2024 CleanPowerSF rates, as well as the

168 *May 23rd Commission meeting on the proposed water and wastewater*
169 *rates.*

170

171 *Public Comment: Mr. David Pilpel thanked the Board Members and SFPUC*
172 *staff.*

173

174 **7. Adjournment**

175

176 *Meeting adjourned at 12:15 PM.*

177

Accessible Meeting Policy: To obtain meeting materials in alternative format, please contact the Rate Fairness Board Secretary at 415-554-3477 or via email at RateFairnessBoard@sfwater.org. Providing at least 72 hours notice will help to ensure availability. Written reports or background materials for calendar items are available on-line at <https://sfpuc.org/about-us/boards-commissions-committees/rate-fairness-board>.

Meeting Procedures: Public Comment will be taken before or during the Board's consideration of each agenda item. Speakers may address the Board for up to three minutes on that item. During General Public Comment, members of the public may address the Board on matters that are within the Board's jurisdiction and are not on the agenda. Procedures do not permit: 1) persons in the audience to vocally express support or opposition to statements by Board Member, by other persons testifying; 2) ringing and use of cell phones, pagers, and similar sound-producing electronic devices; 3) bringing in or displaying signs in the meeting room; and 4) standing in the meeting room. The ringing of and use of cell phones, pagers and similar sound-producing electronic devices are prohibited at this meeting. Please be advised that the Chair may order the removal from the meeting room of any person(s) responsible for the ringing or use of a cell phone, pager, or other similar sound-producing electronic devices.

Know your rights under the Sunshine Ordinance: Government's duty is to serve the public, reaching its decisions in full view of the public. Commissions, boards, councils, and other agencies of the City and County exist to conduct the people's business. This ordinance assures that deliberations are conducted before the people and that City operations are open to the people's review. For information on your rights under the Sunshine Ordinance (Chapter 67 of the San Francisco Administrative Code) or to report a violation of the ordinance, contact by mail Sunshine Ordinance Task Force, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 244, San Francisco, CA 94102; phone at (415) 554-7724; fax at (415) 554-7854; or by e-mail at soff@sfgov.org.

Citizens may obtain a free copy of the Sunshine Ordinance by printing Chapter 67 of the San Francisco Administrative Code on the Internet, at <http://www.sfbos.org/sunshine>.

311 Free Language Assistance: 免費語言協助/ Ayuda gratuita con el idioma / Бесплатная помощь переводчиков / Trợ giúp Thông dịch Miễn phí / Assistance linguistique gratuite / 無料の言語支援/ 무료 언어 / 지원 / คว“มขจ“ยเหลอ“ ท“งภ“ษ“โดยไม“ ส“ยคาใชจ“าย / Libreng tulong para sa wikang Tagalog ยเหลอ“

Lobbyist Registration and Reporting Requirements: Individuals and entities that influence or attempt to influence local legislative or administrative action may be required by the San Francisco Lobbyist Ordinance [SF Campaign & Governmental Conduct Code Sec. 2.100] to register and report lobbying activity. For more information about the Lobbyist Ordinance, please contact the San Francisco Ethics Commission at 25 Van Ness Avenue, Suite 220, San

222 Francisco, CA 94102; telephone (415) 252-3100; fax (415) 252-3112; web site
223 at www.sfgov.org/ethics.

224 **Explanatory documents** that have been provided to the Board in connection
225 with this agenda are available for public inspection online at
226 [https://sfpuc.org/about-us/boards-commissions-committees/rate-fairness-](https://sfpuc.org/about-us/boards-commissions-committees/rate-fairness-board)
227 [board](https://sfpuc.org/about-us/boards-commissions-committees/rate-fairness-board).